

**SBEADMR Adaptive Management Group Meeting Notes
January 30, 2020**

The SBEADMR Adaptive Management Group (AMG) met at 1:00 PM on Thursday, January 30, 2020
In the Uncompahgre Room at the GMUG Supervisor’s Office in Delta. Present and representing the various “seats”
on the AMG were:

<u>Designated Seat</u>	<u>Regular Member</u>	<u>Alternate Member</u>
Delta County	Robbie LeValley	Mark Roeber
Gunnison County	absent	TBD
Hinsdale County	absent	absent
Montrose County	absent	Justin Mussser
Ouray County	absent	absent
San Miguel County	Hilary Cooper	Lynn Padgett
Environmental/Conservation	Chris Jauhola	Ben Katz*
Environmental/Conservation	Lexi Tuddenham	absent
Forestry Processor	Tim Kylo	TBD
Forestry Logger	Molly Pitts	TBD
Community at Large		
East Zone	TBD	TBD
North Zone	Mary Chapman	TBD
West Zone	Nancy Fishing	Andy Goldman
Water Resources	Lynn Padgett	absent
Recreational User Groups	Ralph Files	TBD
Wildlife and Fish	Craig Grother	Jamie Nogle
Education	TBD	TBD

*Ben Katz from Western Slope Conservation Center attended as a guest on behalf of alternate Robin Nicholoff

Resource/Staff Present: Clay Speas, Carlyn Perovich, Nicole Hutt, and Kim Phillips, GMUG Nat’l Forest; Tony Cheng, Jason Sibold and Mike Battaglio, SBEADMR Science Team; Kamie Long, Colorado State Forest Service; and Susan Hansen, Meeting Facilitator

Guests Present: Cindy Dozier, Hinsdale County resident, Ben Katz, Western Slope Conservation Center (WSCC) and Tony Edwards, GMUG Deputy Forest Supervisor

Approval of May 2, 2019 AMG Meeting Notes: The 5/2/19 AMG meeting notes were approved as amended to include an additional note to Item No. 3: Brief Update on Scheduled Treatments for 2019. Craig Grother noted that the proposed Wolfe Timber Sale on the Norwood District was deleted from the schedule response to comments received during the public comment period.

Item No. 1: Brief Recap of 2019 AMG Activities – Susan Hansen, Facilitator

February, 2019	AMG membership meeting prior to annual SBEADMR Stakeholder Meeting
April, 2019	GMUG Annual SBEADMR Stakeholder Meeting
May, 2019	AMG membership meeting to consider recommendations for adaptation to submit to the Forest Leadership Team
June, 2019	AMG Monitoring Committee met with Science Team to revise draft Monitoring Matrix
August, 2019	Summer Field Trips: Pre-treatment site visit: Big Park Timber Sale site and Post-treatment site: High Mesa Timber Sale
November, 2019	Email distributed updating AMG membership of summer field work and summer field trips

December, 2019

Monitoring Committee met with Science Team to review revised drafts of Science Team and AMG monitoring matrices

Item No. 2: Report from SBEADMR AMG Monitoring Committee – Committee Members

Based on comments raised at the 5/2/2019 AMG Meeting regarding how the original Monitoring Matrix is evolving into a very complex and technical document, the Science Team and the AMG Monitoring Committee met in June and December to address the concerns. It was decided to separate the Science Team’s monitoring questions, findings and interpretation from the AMG’s monitoring questions and create two separate matrices as follows:

a. January 2020 Update of Science Teams Monitoring Matrix (attached) – Carlyn Perovich

Carlyn Perovich, GMUG Forest Ecologist and member of the SBEADMR Science Team, provided an overview of the changes for the Science Team’s “side” of the original matrix. The Science Team’s revised format tracks the Science Team’s monitoring questions, indicators/methods, current findings and interpretations. She noted that the main changes are organizational: adding the project title, identifying the lead person for each project and identifying the years measured. She did not go through the columns of Science Team’s current findings or interpretations, but emphasized information contained in those columns would be “homework” for the AMG members to review and digest for the next AMG meeting when the group would be considering recommendations to submit to the Forest Leadership Team’s annual Management Review of the SBEADMR project.

In response to a question of whether the matrix would represent a compilation of all the years measured or would there be annual updates, Jason Sibold explained it would generally be a compilation that would be updated in the Interpretation column based on current year’s findings. He suggested a year-to-year assessment could be referenced if there is a wide range in what the Science Team finds from year to year, e.g. seed production between 2017 and 2018. He suggested keeping such anomalies in the Interpretation column and note variability from year to year.

Carlyn also introduced the “SBEADMR Summer Fieldwork 2019 Summary Report” (attached) which is a new report prepared by the Science Team this year. The summary report captures the annual summer fieldwork of a specific year, new findings, and some interpretations for the AMG to consider as part of its “homework” for recommending appropriate treatment adaptations. This report focusing on SBEADMR related science team work will be prepared annually (January) each year by the Science Team and will be presented at the Annual SBEADMR Stakeholder meeting.

Carlyn concluded by stating that she felt with the two documents the Science Team had made great strides reorganizing how they collect data and interpret data and figuring out how it all fits together. She encouraged AMG members to review both documents when considering recommendations for treatment adaptations.

b. 10/29/19 Draft Adaptive Management Monitoring Matrix (attached) - Tony Cheng

Tony Cheng, Colorado Forest Restoration Institute (CFRI) and member of the SBEADMR Science Team, introduced a revised AMG “side” of the original matrix and explained the rationale behind the revision. Recognizing the confusion or disconnect of how the various pieces of the SBEADMR adaptive management approach come together, he designed a matrix with different columns to show the linkages between four distinct aspects of the adaptive management approach: 1) the goals or decision triggers identified in the SBEADMR Record of Decision (ROD); 2) the monitoring and research activities and results; 3) the AMG’s interpretations and recommendations and 4) the GMUG Forest Leadership Team’s Management Review conclusions. The revised AMG matrix is an effort to lay out the goals of the project, the research questions raised about the project, the results of monitoring and how those impact different management decisions going forward. By tracking this annually, people will hopefully understand overtime where the SBEADMR program and adaptive management process is in terms of objectives and types of management decisions given all the monitoring.

c. Discuss Expectation of AMG Members to Consider and Formulate Recommendations for Adaptions

The Adaptive Management Monitoring Matrix will be a primary focus of the March 2020 AMG meeting. At that meeting the group will be tasked with completing the fourth column “Adaptive Management Group Interpretation and Recommendations” based on three sources of information:

- The Science Team’s Updated Monitoring Matrix
- SBEADMR Summer Fieldwork 2019 Summary Report
- Science Team’s Presentations at the February, 2020 Annual SBEADMR Stakeholder Meeting

It was also noted that the Forest Service will populate some of the columns with information that it has collected specific to lynx habitats. Molly Pitts will be populating columns regarding some of socio-economic impact questions. AMG recommendations will be submitted to the GMUG Leadership Team for its annual Management Review which typically occurs in late spring.

d. Consider Interest and/or Value in Broadening the Socio-Economic Questions in Monitoring Matrix

Just prior to the regular AMG meeting, the AMG Monitoring Committee met with Tony Cheng (conference line) to consider whether or not to broaden the socio-economic monitoring and indicators beyond the current indicators for the timber industry and public participation and understanding. Other indicators suggested include impact on roads, tourism, recreation and/or local governments. After a brief report of points raised during that Monitoring Committee meeting and discussion among AMG members regarding the interest in broadening the socio-economic component, the matter was referred back to the Monitoring Committee to explore further within established sidebars for data gathering. Some of the key points of discussion were:

- Consider limiting data gathering efforts to existing or readily accessible data rather than spending money on the “finer scale” level of data, e.g. random surveys, interviews, questionnaires, etc.
- Focus on road impacts initially since roads are the issue that is raised most often; both the Forest Service and counties have available data on roads; Forest Service has data going back to 2016
- Start by looking at one or two specific treatment projects with readily accessible road cost/benefit data, e.g. Little Cone or the completed High Mesa salvage sale
- Concern that this exercise may be “too big a bite” to take on and could lead to opening a “can of worms” – outside the scope or parameters of the ROD;
- The value of the exercise may be more informational in nature for the AMG, e.g. cost/benefit of road construction/improvements associated with a specific SBEADMR project

Item No. 3: Review/Discuss Annual Timeline/Responsible Parties for Providing Input and Updating Matrices and AMG Meeting Schedule - Carlyn Perovich

Carlyn distributed copies of a draft timeline she had put together for FS staff and Science Team to map out what to do and when in an effort to standardize the process and be as clear as possible so everyone knows what is expected and when it is due. A couple of key considerations were whether or not there needs to be a meeting of the AMG in January and how to address the gap of time between the March/April AMG meeting where recommendations for adaptation are formulated and the following February for the Annual GMUG SBEADMR Stakeholder meeting. It was the consensus of the group to:

- move the purpose statements of the January AMG meeting to the March/April AMG meeting
- Only schedule an early winter (January AMG meeting) if needed
- Consider scheduling an AMG meeting in early fall after the summer field trips to review field trips and serve as an interim meeting if needed between the March/April AMG meeting and the February Stakeholder meeting

Item No. 4: Report Update on Public Outreach Efforts – Commissioner Cooper and Kim Phillips

a. Freelance Journalist – Annual Report:

Hilary Cooper and Carlyn Perovich provided an update on the SBEADMR Annual Report that freelance journalist Heather Sackett has been contracted to develop in conjunction with FS staff and Science Team members for distribution to the general public. Hilary reviewed the various topics that were proposed to be included, the

challenges in trying to make sense of and simplify all the information in a way that would be understandable and meaningful for the general public and asked for feedback from the AMG. General consensus was to try and simplify the report along the lines of an Executive Summary for the general public. The report will include some pictures/graphics and a map of completed and near-term timber and non-commercial treatments for the public to see where activities have occurred/are occurring. A final draft of the report will be sent out to Monitoring Committee for review prior to publication with the goal that it would be available as a handout the February Annual SBEADMR Stakeholder meeting.

b. SBEADMR Communication Plan – Kim Phillips

Kim reported that the schedule of meetings/timelines in the SBEADMR Communication Plan had been correlated with the schedule that Carlyn reviewed above. There were no other updates to report.

c. PLP SBEADMR Webpage – Susan Hansen

Susan reported that since PLP has dissolved the SBEADMR AMG webpage hosted and maintained by has not been kept up since late spring, 2019. There was interest in archiving that information and possibly finding another site to host the SBEADMR AMG documents, notices, minutes, etc. Tony Cheng offered that CFRI hosts project sites for projects it is engaged with. Susan Hansen and Kim Phillips will follow up with Tony on this suggestion.

Item No. 5: Plan for GMUB Annual SBEADMR Stakeholder Meeting – Carlyn Perovich

Date: Thursday, February 27, 2020

Place: Montrose Pavilion, Montrose, CO

Time: 9:00 AM to 3:15 PM

Agenda: The meeting format will be similar to the 2019 Annual Meeting. A morning session will consist of presentations from the Science Team and a roundtable panel discussion with the Science Team and attendees. The afternoon session will focus on SBEADMR implementation activities and break-out poster sessions for each timber zone to look at the out-year (2020-2022) program of work in each timber zone.

Item No.6: Housekeeping Issues – Susan Hansen

a. AMG Membership Status: Susan announced that Tim Kylo Of Montrose Forest Products will take Norm Birtcher’s seat representing the forestry processors; Molly Pitts of Pitts Resource Consulting, LLC will take Mike Ganroth’s seat representing forestry loggers. Cindy Dozier will no longer be representing Hinsdale County Commissioners but will continue to attend as an interested Hinsdale County resident. All other regular and alternate seats appear to remain the same.

b. AMG Operations Manual: Susan suggested that the AMG should review and update the Operations Manual periodically. A review will be scheduled as an agenda item for a future AMG meeting.

Public Comments:

Cindy Dozier, Hinsdale County resident: Referred back to the discussion about broadening the scope of the socio-economic components of monitoring matrix. She shared concern that this may be a “big bite” and was concerned how changing or expanding the parameters and criteria for collecting data may impact or alter how data gathered earlier is used. Also asked if the benefits of impacts would be measured as well as the costs. This concern will be referred back to Monitoring Committee for its continuing discussion of broadening the socio-economic component.

Schedule Next Meeting: The next meeting of the AMG is scheduled for Thursday, March 26, 2020 from 1:00 PM–4:00 PM in the Uncompahgre Room of the GMUG Supervisor’s Office in Delta. *(Ed Note: This meeting date was postponed until further notice due to the COVID-19 pandemic)*

Adjourn: After a round of closing comments from AMG members the meeting was adjourned at 3:00 PM.

Notes compiled by Susan Hansen, Facilitator